

PATIENT TRUST ON THE HOSPITAL SERVICE DELIVERY SYSTEM

Abdul Haeba Ramli
Universitas Indonesia Timur, Makassar
Email : ramli.haeba@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

This research was conducted in 2016 to see the effect of the service delivery system on patient trust in private hospitals in Makassar. The number of patients used as respondents was 115 people, taken using purposive sampling technique, with several criteria set by the author. However, the results of this study indicate that a service delivery system consisting of contact personal and physical support has a positive and significant effect on patient trust.

Keywords: *Service Delivery System, Physical Support, Contact Personal, Patient Trust*

INTRODUCTION

Since Lovelock and Wright (2002) introduced a service delivery system, the research on this theory was growing and was mostly carried out by researchers. This Service Delivery System is actually about how, when and where should the provider to deliver its services to customers, which consist of system elements in the operation of these services and all things presented to consumers.

According to Ramli (2013), the Service Delivery System consists of two elements, namely Physical Support which supports service providers, namely in the form of immovable objects, real and can be felt by patients such as decent buildings, representative equipment, beautiful interior of buildings, exterior of the building, parking facilities, canteen, bank, and security guarantees, and full support from all employees and hospital management. This opinion is similar to what was said by Hutton & Richard (1995), that at the Hospital there is a physical environment in the form of locations, equipment and facilities that are considered important by the Hospital's patients. While Contact personnel are all employees who carry out their duties as service providers from the provider in this case the Hospital to patients, which in turn will affect the perceptions of the recipients of these services (patients). This opinion confirms the theory of Nguyen & Leblanc (2002), saying that contact personnel are composed of all employees who are in the spearhead area of the organization and are directly related to the customers or also referred to in this study are patients of private hospitals.

Sarwono (2003) states that patients who receive health services from a hospital will be determined by how they trust the institution. The trust that arises is an inseparable part of how a service provider institution builds its image (Ramli, 2010). Of course it will have an impact on the visit or utilization of health services in the hospital, the better the image of the hospital for the customer, it will automatically build a good perception for the customer, especially based on health services provided and perceived by the customer itself. This view is confirmed by the findings of Ramli (2012) who think that the service delivery system provided by a hospital consists of Physical Support and Contact Personnel will make a good image for a hospital, if the service received by the patient is in line with

expectations. And if this happens, then the patient's trust in the Hospital to cure the disease will increase.

Huang and Liu (2010) found that the trustees of service recipients would be high if the service capacity provided by providers increased. Similarly, the findings of Kim, et al. (2008) and Ramli (2012), said that the quality of service delivery provided by the company would increase consumer confidence in service providers. This is also confirmed by Ramli and Sjahruddin (2015) that trust that arises from within the patient is caused by a feeling of comfort in the responsibilities shown by the Hospital in providing medical services. The Arafah (2004) explains that to be able to influence the patient's confidence or belief in the healing that he will get, then what must be maintained and carried out by the Hospital as a provider of health services is to prove the provision of services in accordance with patient expectations, so that the reality of appropriate services with the desire of the patient will make the recipient of the service will increase his confidence in the quality of services of the Hospital (Ramli, 2016).

Customer trust is a major factor and contributes greatly to the company's success in doing business (Anderson & Srinivasan, 2003). Therefore, consumer trust in this case is patients, will be very important to note for service providers. Morgan and Hunt (1994) with the concept of relationship marketing show how important it is to maintain and foster good connections with consumers by maintaining their trust so that they can build long-term relationships and cooperation.

LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Effect of Hospital Contact Personnel on patient's Trust

Effective marketing depends on the development and management of customer trust so that customers specifically buy a service before experiencing it (Shamdasani and Balakrishnan, 2000: 403). Management of trust is determined by the services, personal, technological and system resources that are used so that customer trust in the resources involved and the company itself is maintained and strengthened (Shamdasani and Balakrishnan, 2000: 403). Kreitner and Kinicki (2001: 422) state that trust is the belief of a party regarding the intentions and behavior of the other part. Consumer trust is also

defined that service providers can be trusted or relied upon in fulfilling their promises (Sideshmuhk et al., 2002: 17).

Trust is the basis of strategic partnerships, because relationships based on trust are highly valued, so interested parties will want to commit themselves to such relationships (Morgan and Hunt, 1994: 24). Trust is the main determinant in relationship commitment (Morgan and Hunt, 1994: 24), while Bloemer et al (2002: 69) states that trust and commitment are mediators between trust and loyalty. Garbarino and Johnson (1999: 71) also place more emphasis on individual trusts by referring to consumer confidence in the quality and reliability of services provided.

Contact personnel are all human elements involved in the delivery of services and have direct contact with buyers. According to Nguyen and Leblanc (2002: 245) contact personnel is composed of all employees who are at the front line of the organization and have direct contact with customers. According to Snook (1992: 65) hospital medical staff are doctors, dentists, podiatrists, and health professional staff who care for patients. Kim et al (2000: 290) found that the most important element in services at hospitals was doctors and nurses. Doctors and nurses play an important role in creating service quality in a hospital, while Nguyen and Leblanc (2002) found that the capacity of a doctor and nurse will function to stimulate the patient to be able to quickly become healthy, especially his ability to sympathetically and kindly give care and attention specifically to the patient.

As a high contact service, hospital personnel is central to service delivery. In accordance with the opinion of Lovelock and Wright (2002: 197) that, "in high-contact services, service personnel are central to service delivery." Lovelock and Wright (2002: 324) further state that, "in the eyes of their customers, service personnel may also be seen as an integral part of the service experience.

According to Nguyen and Leblanc, (2002: 250) contact personnel indicators are appearance, competence and professionalism. According to Nguyen and Leblanc (2002: 245) the appearance of personnel is a combination of clothing, hairstyle, make up, and cleanliness. Employee competencies are supported by expertise and experience. Zeithaml and Bitner (2000: 19) explain that all attitudes and actions of employees, even the way employees dress and the appearance of employees have an influence on consumer perceptions or the success of real-time services.

Shamdasani and Balakrishnan (2000: 402) contact personnel indicators, namely, expertise, similarity, knowledge, hospitality and mutual disclosure. The speed of personnel in completing their work will make them happy. According to Best, from the customer side, the speed of access to obtain services is important in the service delivery system (Best, 2000: 230). This is supported by Aschner (1999: 453) stating that in the service sector, almost all service attributes are determined by the customer's assessment of the speed and accuracy of the officers in responding to their complaints.

Furthermore Kouzes (1993: 32) states that the commitment of high human resources is able to produce good business. This opinion is also supported by Gudmundson and Cristine (2002: 6), they stated that personnel functioning as service providers in service organizations should realize that they are actually marketers and their behavior will influence the success of an organization in the long run.

Previous research provides evidence, that contact personnel affects customer trust (Shamdasani and Balakrishnan, 2000: 399), while Bloemer et.al (2002: 68) states that the quality of company services affects customer trust. Ratni (2009) found that in research conducted on star hotels in Sumatra, the result was that contact personnel had an indirect effect on customer trust.

Based on the empirical evidence above, the following hypothesis is proposed:

H1 : *Contact Personnel Hospital's has a positive and significant effect on patient trust*

2. Effect of Hospital Physical Support on Patient Trust

Conceptually, trust exists if a part has confidence in the integrity and reliability of the other parts (Morgan and Hunt, 1994: 23). Another definition is also described by Rotters (1967: 65) that trust is a general expectation of a person or in other words can be trusted. The two definitions also emphasize the importance of trust. Rousseau (1998: 395) states that trust is a psychological state containing the desire to accept deficiencies, based on positive behavior towards intentions or other behaviors in a risk and interdependent state, while Robbin (2003: 336) states that trust is a positive expectation that others do not will act opportunistically. According to Callaghan, et. Al., 1995 and Bologlu (2002: 50) the dimensions of trust are defined as dimensions of business relationships that determine the degree to which people feel they can depend on the integrity of promises offered by others.

Referring to the provisions in the field of social psychology and marketing, Donney and Cannon (1997: 36) define "Trust as perceived credibility and benevolence of a target of trust." From this definition trust can be seen from two dimensions. The first dimension is credibility of exchange partners, and expectations that the partner word or written statement can be relied on. The second dimension of benevolence is the extent to wish one partner is genuinely interested in the other partners' welfare and motivated to seek joint again.

The literature on trust suggests that confidence in parties who are trusted is reliable and has high integrity, accompanied by certain qualities that are consistent, competent, honest, fair, responsible, helpful and good (Morgan and Hunt, 1994: 23). Trusts arise from a long process until both parties trust each other. If trust is already established between the customer and the company, the effort to build it is not too difficult. In the process of forming trust (trust), Donney and Cannon (1997: 38) explain in detail the factors that influence it, such as the reputation of the company, the size of the company, mutual love, both between customers and companies and between customers and company employees. Consumer trust is believed to play a role in the formation of customer perceptions in their relationships with service companies (Taylor, 2001: 32).

According to Barnes (2003: 149), several important elements of trust are:

- a. Trust is a development of past experiences and actions.
- b. The character that is expected from a partner, such as being trustworthy and reliable.
- c. Trust involves a willingness to put yourself at risk.
- d. Trust involves feeling safe and confident in the partner.

From a marketing standpoint, this states that the development of trust should be a fundamental component of a marketing strategy aimed at leading to the creation of true customer relations. The customer must be able to feel that he can rely on the company. But building trust takes a long time and develops after repeated meetings with customers. More importantly, trust develops after an individual takes risks in dealing with his partner. This shows that building trustworthy relationships will be more likely to occur in certain industrial sectors, especially those involving short-term or long-term risk taking by

customers (Barnes, 2003: 149). Shamdasani and Balakrishnan (2000: 421) use integrity and reliability as indicators to measure customer trust.

The physical support based on theory according to Nguyen and Leblanc (2002: 245, 1996: 33) is all provider facilities that are not included in human or employee resources, such as building infrastructure, equipment, location and others. The physical support measured on ambient conditions, atmosphere, exterior design, interior design, decoration, parking facilities, appearance of buildings and parks and locations. Ambient conditions consist of various elements such as color, lighting, temperature, noise, smell and music. Shamdasani and Balakrishnan (2000: 407) physical environment measured by ambient, symbols and objects. In hospitals the physical environment includes locations, equipment and facilities, which are considered important by hospital patients (Hutton and Richardson, 1995: 52). Strategic location of the hospital both connected with public facilities and facilities to achieve it. This is in accordance with the opinion of Heskett et al. (1997: 154) that one of the elements in the service delivery system is location.

Boy S. (2004: 12) states that location is used to reach the intended customers and requires relatively fast time. Physical facilities are immovable objects, real and can be felt by patients such as representative equipment, beautiful interior of buildings, exterior of buildings, parking facilities, canteens, banks, and security guarantees. Hospital equipment is equipment owned by the hospital that is directly related to the needs of the patient, whereas according to Hutton and Richardson (1995: 52) the food provided can also be made as part of the physical evidence at the hospital. Facilities that are seen by consumers are part of an important manifestation of the overall services offered (Chriswardani, 1998). The comfort level in the hospital also needs to be considered in addition to facilities and equipment. This is in accordance with the opinion of Boy S. (2004: 12) also states that hospitals need to maintain comfort in addition to adequate equipment, while the results of Alrubaiee's research (2011) in the banking service industry that the comfort level affects the quality of service delivery systems.

In addition, the room layout and service procedures provided by officers are important elements in service delivery. According to Heskett & Kotter (1998: 9) also states that the service delivery system is important and is related to spatial planning, layout and work procedures.

Previous research provides evidence that physical environment affects customer trust (Shamdasani and Balakrishnan, 2000: 399), while Bloemer et.al (2002: 68) states that the quality of company services influences customer trust. Ratni (2009) found that research conducted at starred hotels in Sumatra physical environment had a positive effect on customer trust.

Based on the empirical evidence above, the following hypothesis is proposed:

H2 : *Physical Support Hospital's has a positive and significant effect on patient trust*

RESEARCH METHOD

This research is using a quantitative method with an explanatory research approach that is trying to find and collect data through questionnaires to process the data using one step. As for the basis for the author to use explanatory research knowing that the purpose of this research is how to obtain and prove, in order to obtain an empirical explanation of the influence of the Personal Contact and Physical Support Hospital on patient trust in hospitals in the city of Makassar. , After data processing is obtained, it will be concluded whether the hypothesis made was accepted or rejected.

Several private hospitals in the city of Makassar were the sites for this study. As for the object of research is patients who get treatment according to the criteria set by the researcher, one of which is each patient who has received hospitalization. The time of data collection in the period December to February 2016 which amounted to 115 patients. The sampling technique used purposive sampling, namely respondents determined by researchers using certain criteria (Sekaran, 2006), so the criteria are with the conditions (1) inpatients in health services in Makassar, at least being inpatients for 3 days, (2) patients who can provide information or can communicate well so that they can fill out questionnaires, whereas if patients cannot provide information about this research, they can be replaced by family or partners, (3) patients understand the filling out of the questionnaire after being explained by the researcher. The analysis method starts from looking at the characteristics of the data through descriptive statistics and then the analysis of the multivariate data analysis model includes factor analysis and Partial Least Square (PLS).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Testing of four hypotheses was proposed using Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) with the help of PLS software. Hypothesis test decision making is to look at the results of t-value, where if the value is positive it means that the variable has a positive effect, while to see its significance is to refer to the t-statistic value between variables, if the t value obtained is greater than t-table amounting to 1.96, meaning that the effect is significant (Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E., 2010). The results of this research, can be seen in the table below:

Table 4: Hypothesis Test Result

Variables	T Statistics (O/STERR)
<i>Contact Personnel</i> ->Patient Trust	2.2511
<i>Physical Support</i> ->Patient Trust	2.1916

Sourch: PLS Results Data Processing, 2016

In the table shows that all the influence between one variable to another variable shows positive values, including:

1. The influence of contact personnel and patient trust is positive and significant because the t-value is 2.25 which means positive and significant because it is greater than the t-table of 1.96.
2. The influence of physical support and patient trust is positive and significant because the t-value is 2.19 which means positive and significant because it is greater than the t-table of 1.96.

CONCLUSION

From testing the hypothesis, the conclusions from the research are obtained, namely:

1. Contact Personnel has a positive and significant effect on patient trust. With a greater and more significant influence than Physical support, the Hospital must pay attention

to the capacity of officers who carry out service services to patients, because they are the ones who deal directly with patients, so that their abilities are as expected by patients, the patient's trust will be high and have a strong belief in the healing that he will get from hospital services by reliable officers, such as: Medical staff, namely Doctors, Midwives, Nurses, and other nursing assistants, such as Pharmacy officers, Laboratory Officers, Radiology Officers, and Officers others.

2. Physical Support has a positive and significant effect on patient trust. Although the effect is smaller than the effect of Contact Personel. So with this result, it shows that the company must also pay attention to the physical facilities that will be supporting the process of service to care for the patient's recovery. So that patients who are treated at the Hospital, will trust and will continue to use its services.

REFERENCES

- Alrubaiee, L. 2011. The Mediating Effect of Patient Satisfaction in the Patients' Perceptions of Healthcare Quality – Patient Trust Relationship. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*. Vol.3. No.1. Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education.
- Arafah, Willy. 2004. Analisis Kualitas Pelayanan Rumah Sakit Terhadap Image (Studi pada Rumah Sakit pemerintah X” di Jakarta Selatan). *Metode Riset Bisnis dan Manajemen*. Volume 4.No. 1.April : 55-75.
- Aschner, Gabor S. (1999). Meeting Customers Requirements and What Can be Expected. *The TQM Magazine* Vol.11 No.6: 450-455.
- Anderson, R., & Srinivasan, S. (2003). E-satisfaction and e-loyslty: a contongecy framework. *Psychology and Marketing*, Vol. 20 No. 2, 123-138.
- Best Roger J, (2001). *Consumer Behaviour, Building Marketing Strategy*, McGraw-Hill Higher Education, New York, USA.
- Bloemer, Josce, Gaby, Odekerken-Schroder. (2002). Store Satisfaction and Store Loyalty Explained by Costomer and Store Related Factors. *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior*.15: 68- 83.
- Boy S.Sabarguna. 2004. Pemasaran Rumah Sakit. Yogyakarta: Konsorsium RSI: 1-21.
- Chriswardani, S. (1998). Pengembangan Indikator Kepercayaan Pasien Rumah Sakit Di Jawa tengah, Riset Pembinaan Kesehatan (Risbinkes). Balitbangkes Departemen kesehatan RI.

- Boland, P. (2013). How a large hospital system protected by putting patients first. Managed Care. Retrieved from <http://www.managed-caremag.com/archives/1302/1302.bookreview.html>
- D,Marzaweny & Hadiwidjojo (2012). Analisis Kepercayaan Pasien sebagai Mediasi Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan Kesehatan terhadap Citra Rumah Sakit Umum Daerah (RSUD) Arifin Achmad Pekanbaru. Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen, Vol. 10 Nomor 3, 2012.
- Doney, M.P., Cannon, P. 1997. An Examination of the Nature of Trust in Buyer-Seller Relationships, Journal of Marketing, Volume 61.(April 1997):35-51.
- Garbarino, Ellen., Mark, S, Johnson. (1999). The different roles of satisfaction, trust, and commitment in customer relationships, Journal of Marketing. 63: 70-87.
- Gudmundson dan Cristine. 2002. Internal Marketing: A Way of Improving Service Quality. Sweden: Ostersund: 6-12.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis*. (7th, Ed.). Pearson Education.
- Heskett & Kotter (1998). *Corporate Culture and Performance*. Terjemah : Benyamin Molan. Jakarta : Prehallindo.
- Huang, E., & Liu, C. C. (2010). A Study on trust building and its derived value in C2C e-commerce. Journal of Global Business Management 6(1), 186-95.
- Hutton, James, D., Lynne, Richardson. (1995). Healthscapes: the role of facility and physical environment on consumer attitudes, satisfaction. Quality assessments, and behaviors. Health care management review. 20 : 48-60
- Kantsperger, R. & Kunz W H (2010) Consumer trust in service companies a multiple mediating analysis Managing Service Quality An International Journal 20 (1) 4-25 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/09604521011011603>
- Kim, K.H., et al. 2008. Brand Equity in Hospital Marketing, © 2007 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved, Journal of Business Research, 61, (2008): 75-82. [1]
- Kinlock, B. L., Parker, L. J., Bowie, J. V., Howard, D. L., LaVeist, T. A., & Orpe, R. J., Jr. (2017). High levels of medical mistrust are associated with low quality of life among black and white men with prostate cancer. Cancer Control, 24(1), 72-77.
- Kotler P., Keller, K.L. 2009. Manajemen Pemasaran, Edisi 13, Jilid 1. Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga.
- Montagione, C.J. 1999. The Physician-Patient Relationship: Cornerstone of Patient Trust, Satisfaction, and Loyalty. Journal of Management Care Quality. Vol. 7. (3): 5-21.
- Kotler, Philip & Kevin Lane Keller. 2012. Marketing Management, 14e, Global Edition, Pearson Educational Limited, England
- Kouzes, J.M & Posner, B.Z. (1993). *Credibility: How leaders gain and lose it, why people demand it*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass Publisher.
- Kreitner, Robert and Angelo Kinicki, (2001). *Organizational Behaviour*. Fifth Edition. Irwin McGraw-Hill.

- LaVeist, T. A. (2009). Measuring trust in health care: Medical Mistrust Index 2.1. Hopkins Center for Health Disparities Solutions Projects. Retrieved from <http://www.jhsph.edu/research/centers-and-institutes/johns-hopkins-center-for-health-disparities-solutions/Projects/MMT.html>
- LaVeist, T. A., Isaac, L. A., & Williams, K. P. (2009). Mistrust of health care organizations is associated with underutilization of health services. *Health Services Research*, 44(6), 2093–2105.
- Lim, Cheng Puay and Nelson K.H. Tang. 2000. *A Study of Patients Expectation and Satisfaction in Singapore Hospital International*. *Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance* 13 No.7: 290-299.
- Lovelock, Christopher., Lauren, Wright. (2002). *Principles of service marketing and management*. USA: Prentice Hall International, Inc. 50-325
- Morgan, R. M., & Hunt, S. D. (1994). The commitment-trust theory of relationship marketing. *The Journal of Marketing*, 58 (3). 20-38.
- Nguyen, N., and LeBlanc, G. 1998. The Mediating Role of Corporate Image on Customers Retention Decisions: An Investigation in Financial Services, *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 16 (2):52–65.
- Nguyen, N., and LeBlanc, G. 2002. Contact Personnel, Physical Environment, and The Perceived Corporate Image of Intangible Services by New Clients, *International Journal of Service Industry Management* 13 (3):242–262.
- Ramli, AH (2010), Analisis Strategi Pemasaran PT. Sandoz Indonesia Cabang Makassar Terhadap Penjualan Produk Di Makassar. *Jurnal Ilmiah Aktualita* 2 (KPN-Bung Kopertis IX Sulawesi, Makassar), 203-216
- Ramli, AH. (2012). Strategi Pemasaran pada Industri Farmasi. Pustaka Timur, Yogyakarta.
- Ramli, AH (2012). Pengaruh Fasilitas Pendukung Fisik di Rumah Sakit Stella Maris Terhadap Citra Rumah Sakit Stella Maris di Makassar. *Progresif Journal* 5 (02), 1-22
- Ramli, AH (2013). Pengaruh Sistem Penyampaian Jasa Terhadap Citra Rumah Sakit Swasta Tipe C Di Makassar. *Media Riset Bisnis & Manajemen* 13 (2), 147-168
- Ramli, AH & Sjahrudin (2015). Building Patient Loyalty in Healthcare Services. *International Review of Management and Business Research* Vol. 4 Issue.2. 391-401.
- Ramli, AH. (2016). Patient Service and Satisfaction System. *Business And Entrepreneurial (BER)* Vol. 15, No. 2 (2016), pp. 189-200.
- Ratni, Prima, Lita. (2009). Model hubungan contact personnel. Physical environment, kepuasan, kepercayaan, komitmen dan loyalitas pelanggan. Dirjen Dikti Dept Pendidikan Nasional.
- Sarwono, S. (2003). *Sosiologi kesehatan: beberapa konsep beserta aplikasinya*. Gadjahmada university press, Yogyakarta.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2013). *Research method for Business. A Skill-Building Approach*. 6th edition. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

- Shamdasani Prem N and Audrey Balakrisnan, (2000).“ Determinants of Relationship Quality and Loyalty in Personalized Services “, *Asia Pasific Journal of Management* 17: 399-22.
- Sidesmuhk, D, Jaddig S and Berry S. (2002).Customer Trust, Value, and Loyalty in Relational Exchanges.*Journal of Marketing*, Volume 28, No. 1.
- Snook, I Donald. 1992. *Hospitals, What They Are and How They Work*. Gaithersburg, Maryland: An Aspen Publishers, Inc.: 65-89.
- Sugiyono, 2009, *Metode Penelitian Bisnis (Pendekatan Kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R&D)*. Bandung Alfabeta.
- Zeithaml, V.A. &Bitner, M.J, (2004). *Service marketing : Integrating customer focus across the firm*, 3rd ed. McGrawHill, Boston

Intenitionally Blank